Hiobs Botschaften
Reflections on the Book of Job

International Conference
Potsdam, June 7 – 9, 2012
CHAIR:
Susan Neiman, Potsdam
Participants

JAN ASSMANN

*Job in Egypt? When Justice Fails*

In the Ancient Near Eastern World, the search for sense or meaning—of life, history, (mis)fortune—was paramount, and meaning was equivalent to justice. Meaning or justice is what grants coherence and connectivity, in the course of events—connecting deeds and consequences—as well as in human society, connecting people to forming a community. The Biblical book of Job, as well as several Egyptian texts, deal with a severe crisis of justice, though within completely different cultural frames and suggesting completely different answers.

Israel doubted God’s presence, and posed the fundamental question of faith: “Is the Lord among us, or not?” (Ex 17.7). Job sought to provide an answer.

Gerhard Begrich studied theology, Oriental studies, and Egyptology, earning his Ph.D. from the Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin. He has served as pastor at the Marktkirche in Halle an der Saale and as director of the Gnadau Preachers Seminary. He was president of the Pastors College from 1993 to 2007, and its director of studies until his retirement, in 2009. His books include *Gilgamesch—König und Vagant: Das Epos* (2003); *Schönheit gilt es zu schauen: Theologie und Poesie* (2010), and *Namen und Namen Geschichten in der Bibel* (2011).

Amber Carpenter

"And none of us deserving the cruelty or the grace": In Search of the Buddhist Job

Innocent Bandhula got what he deserved: beheaded along with all his sons due to slander against him. If the Buddhists do not have Job’s problem—do not demand an answer to the question, ‘Why do the innocent suffer?’—it is tempting to suppose that this is because, due to moralized karma and rebirth, no one is innocent. But as Bandhula’s story and many others show, appeals to karma do not have this kind of appeal. Rather, the demand to justify suffering does not arise for the Buddhist because everything suffers—suffering is a mark of existence. That we dislike this fact is not doubted; that the connections between cause and effect are often inscrutable to us, and so our attempts to avoid suffering often in vain, is regrettable—sometimes tragic. This Sophoclean condition of blameless responsibility, in a world without any ultimate author of whom we might demand account, grounds an ethic centered on pity rather than blame, on compassion rather than justice.
Amber Carpenter is a lecturer in the Department of Philosophy at the University of York. She received her B.A. in Philosophy from Yale University in 1996 and her Ph.D. from King’s College London in 2001. 2003 to 2005 she was Assistant Professor at the Franklin & Marshall College, 2005 to 2007 teaching fellow at the University of St. Andrews; in 2007 she was Einstein fellow at the Einstein Forum. She works in Ancient Greek philosophy and in Indian philosophy. Her general interest is in ethics, ancient and modern, and specifically in the place of reason in a well-lived life—what might reason be that it could be ethically relevant, or even required? Her publications include a number of articles on Greek and Indian philosophy. Her book on Indian Buddhist Philosophy will appear later this year.

Michael Ebstein has completed his PhD in the Arabic Language and Literature Department at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. The title of his PhD was "Philosophy, Mysticism and Esotericism: Ismâ‘îlî Thought and Andalusian Mysticism", currently being revised for book publication it as a

Michael Ebstein

Divine Suffering and Human Relief: Job in Ibn al-‘Arabi’s Work Fusus al-Hikam ("The Ring-Gems of the Wisdoms")

The Biblical story of Job, which is referred to (albeit briefly) in the Qurʾān, is often interpreted as an attempt to address the problem of evil in the world and to justify God’s conduct in relation to it (theodicy). This interpretation assumes a clear ontological division between man and God: since the latter is the creator of the world and its governor, one may inquire as to the essence of evil in creation and the reasons for the sufferings of the just. In his well-known work Fuṣūṣ al-Ḥikam ("The Ring-Gems of the Wisdoms"), the famous Muslim Andalusī mystic Muḥyī al-Dīn Abū Ṭālib Maḥmūd b. Ṭālib Ibn al-Ḥarīmī (560/1165-638/1240) construes the story of Job in a most uncommon way, and, one may add, in a most unorthodox manner. Defying the classical monotheistic boundaries that separate God from man, Ibn al-Ḥarīmī views the world at large and man in particular as the external form of God, as the locus for Divine manifestation; God, in his external, manifest aspect, and man are essentially one. Accordingly, in his unique interpretation of the Qurʾānic verses that refer to Job and his plight, Ibn al-Ḥarīmī offers a new perspective on the problem of evil in the world and human suffering, emphasizing the reciprocal relationship between the Creator and the created.
book. He has received a Yad Hanadiv/Rothschild post-doctoral fellowship and is now conducting his post-doctoral research at the Freie Universität in Berlin, in the Institut für Islamwissenschaft. He is part of the research unit "Intellectual History of the Islamicate World". He is interested in medieval Islamic mysticism, particularly in the relation between Sunnah mysticism and Shī‘ī thought. He is also interested in the links and affinities between Jewish and Islamic mysticism, especially as these developed in medieval Spain.

KONSTANTY GEBERT

Lost in Translation

According to the mediaeval commentator Abraham ibn Ezra, the Book of Job has been translated from another language, and is therefore “unclear, like all translated books”. Ibn Ezra was apparently wrong—but in a more fundamental way, he was right. This is a book about lack of clarity on motivation, as humans attempt to comprehend Divine purposes, and translate them into their own terms. As such, it can serve as template of reflection on Divine-human, and indeed human-human misunderstandings.

Konstanty Gebert is an author, journalist, lecturer, and political activist based in Warsaw. In 1976 he graduated from the Department of Psychology at the University of Warsaw. He was a prominent figure in the democratic opposition in Poland in the 1970s and 1980s when he co-founded the unofficial Jewish Flying University (1979), the Polish Council of Christians and Jews (1980), and a trade union of the employees in academia, technology and education which merged with Solidarnosc (1980). In 1981 he avoided internment and during the Martial Law in Poland he continued to write and publish articles for various underground publications under the pseudonym Dawid Warszawski. Gebert also served as a reporter on the war in Bosnia for Gazeta Wyborcza. His articles have been widely published in a variety of national periodicals as well as foreign media. He has written several books, including a first-hand account of the Polish Round Table negotiations of 1989 and a book about the Yugoslav wars of the 1990s. Konstanty Gebert is also the founder and editor of Midrasz, the first Polish-language Jewish periodical in post-communist Poland and he frequently appears on Polish television and radio. Konstanty Gebert has lectured in Poland, Great Britain, France, Italy, Japan, and the USA.
I'll talk about the poem's theological (non-Weberian) disenchantment of the world: the rain falls on uninhabited lands, without meaning or human purpose. In particular, the Job author rejects all attempts to give the cosmos meaning by projecting a magnified version of the human revenge impulse (an eye for an eye) into the deep structure of the world, as if suffering and prosperity were just or deserved punishments and rewards. Paradoxically, what saves Job from his death wish (separation from and disgust at the world) is the unfair blame heaped upon him by his theodicy-obsessed "friends." Job's indignation at his friends' moralizing theodicy (not Job's anger at being abused by God) quickens him. He wants to die but refuses to die guilty (for the death of his children, etc.). The theodicy of his friends does not solve the problem of evil but adds to the evil of suffering the evil of unfair blame. The correctness of Job's anti-theodicy is affirmed by God in the end, even though the stripping of "purpose" from the cosmos is contradicted to some extent by the psychological portrait of God at the beginning of the poem. (He wants to be loved disinterestedly, not from fear of punishment and hope of reward, but cannot be certain of why Job loves him, so great is the disparity of power between God and man, and therefore God is driven to test Job's breaking point, not unjustly but abusively.)

Stephen Holmes is Walter E. Meyer Professor of Law at the New York University School of Law. He received a M.A. from Yale University in 1974 and a M. Phil. also from Yale University in 1975 and his Ph.D., Yale University in 1976. From 1989 to 1997 he was Professor of Political Science and Law at the University of Chicago Law School, and Professor of Politics at Princeton University in 1997. Since 1997 he is Professor of Law at the New York University. In 2000/01 he was fellow at the Wissenschaftskolleg zu Berlin. His publications include Benjamin Constant and the Making of Modern Liberalism (1984); The Anatomy of Antiliberalism (1993); Passions and Constraint: On the Theory of Liberal Democracy (1995); The Cost of Rights: Why Liberty Depends on Taxes (with Cass R. Sunstein, 1998) and The Matador’s Cape: America’s Reckless Response to Terror (2007).
EVA ILOUZ

*Why Job Troubles us*

In this short talk, I would like to compare the biblical character of Job to that of Mendel Singer, the main protagonist of Joseph Roth's Job. The latter book provides us with a modern commentary on the biblical figure, and raises a question that is different from the set of questions evoked by Job's friends and which have been the object of most commentaries (are Job's afflictions a punishment for his hidden sins?). Roth's Job examines how Job understands his own fate, notably around the notion of guilt, as the emotion which reflects personal responsibility for harm inflicted on others, whether that responsibility is real or imagined.

Eva Illouz is Professor of Anthropology and Sociology at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. She received her Ph.D in 1991 from the University of Pennsylvania. She was visiting professor at Northwestern University, Princeton University, at the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales in Paris and fellow at the Wissenschaftskolleg zu Berlin. Her main research interests include the role of culture in social action, the history of emotional life and the impact of knowledge systems on emotions. Among her book publications are *Consuming the Romantic Utopia: Love and Cultural Contradictions of Capitalism* (1997); *Cold Intimacies: The Making of Emotional Capitalism* (2007); *Saving the Modern Soul: Therapy, Emotions, and the Culture of Self-Help* (2008); *Warum Liebe weh tut: Eine soziologische Erklärung* (2011).

GLENN MOST

*The Jobless Greeks*

It is often said that the Book of Job has universal appeal; not only is the text revered and discussed in the three western monotheist religions, but other cultures have books that present comparable problems. Nothing corresponding to the Book of Job can be found in classical Greek thought. This short talk will discuss some of the reasons for this.

Glenn Most is Professor of Greek Philology at the Scuola Normale Superiore in Pisa (since 2001); he also serves as member of the Committee on Social Thought in Chicago (since 1997). Glenn Most studied at Harvard College and Corpus Christi College, Oxford, before receiving his Ph.D. in literature at Yale University in 1980. In the same year he completed a doc-
torate in classics at the University of Tübingen. Glenn Most was Andrew W. Mellon Assistant Professor of Classics at Princeton University and has held professorships at the Universities of Innsbruck and Heidelberg. Most has been Visiting Professor in Siena, Michigan and at the Collège de France, and he was Fellow at the Wissenschaftskolleg zu Berlin. Recent publications include: *Collecting Fragments – Fragmentes sammeln* (Ed., 1997); *Raffael—Die Schule von Athen. Über das Lesen der Bilder* (1999); *Editing Texts – Texte edieren* (Ed., 1998); *Commentaries – Kommentare* (Ed., 1999); *Historicization – Historisierung* (Ed., 2001); *Disciplining Classics – Altertumswissenschaft als Beruf* (Ed., 2002); *Ancient Anger* (Co-ed., 2003); *Doubting Thomas* (2005); and *Sebastiano Timpanaros Genesis of Lachmann’s Method* (Ed., 2005).

**Susan Neiman**

*Reason in the World: A Reading of Job*

In this lecture I will present a philosophical introduction to the *Book of Job*, arguing that the book can be read as centered upon the question of the place of reason in the world. It can thus be as problematic for atheists as for theists. After briefly discussing some of the textual problems that contribute to difficulties in understanding the work, I will offer a Kantian-inspired reading that seeks to defend both Job’s questions, and God’s answers to them.

**Susan Neiman** is director of the Einstein Forum. Born in Atlanta, Georgia, Neiman studied philosophy at Harvard and the Free University of Berlin. She was professor of philosophy at Yale University and Tel Aviv University before coming to the Einstein Forum in 2000. Her works include *Slow Fire: Jewish Notes from Berlin* (1992); *The Unity of Reason: Rereading Kant* (1994); *Evil in Modern Thought* (2002) and *Moral Clarity: A Guide for Grown-up Idealists* (2008).

**James E. Ponet**

*Moses as Job*

This paper explores some of the implications of the Babylonian Talmud's laconic observation that the Book of Job, the least "biblical" of the Bible's books, was authored by Moses (Baba Batra 14B). In considering Moses as
author, it addresses the themes of evil, comfort and consolation, beauty, and friendship as these find expression in both Bible and Talmud.

James Ponet is the Howard M. Holtzmann Jewish Chaplain at Yale, where he has served as a religious leader since 1981. He earned his undergraduate degree from Yale in Religious studies and his masters and doctoral degrees from Hebrew Union College, where he was ordained in 1973. Rabbi Ponet lived in Israel from 1974—1981, studying Jewish thought at Hebrew University in Jerusalem and serving as a Fellow and teacher at both the Shalom Hartman Institute and the Pardes Institute. He returned from Israel in 1981 to become Yale’s Jewish Chaplain, a position he has held ever since.

Jan Philipp Reemtsma

Can We Forgive a God?
Theologians commonly read the Book of Job as the first attempt to grapple with the problem of evil. This is humbug, of course, but theology depends on the absence of a proper historical framework. What we can say is that Job’s friends articulate the classic (and, ultimately, only possible) response to the problem of evil, which in essence is also the one offered by Leibniz: human beings fail to see the big picture. Job agrees, but draws a different conclusion: God does what he wants, and it doesn’t concern us. Only, God’s actions can cause us suffering, and because we suffer, we cry out, yet God ignores our cries. The story of Christ can be read as a failed attempt to give the Book of Job its moral salvation.

Jan Philipp Reemtsma is director of the Hamburg Institute for Social Research. Reemtsma studied German Literature and Philosophy in Hamburg and also received his doctorate there. From 1996 until 2007 he was Professor for Contemporary German Literature at the University of Hamburg. In 2008 he was the Johannes Gutenberg-Professor at the University of Mainz; in 2009, he was Schiller-Professor at the University of Jena. In 1981 Reemtsma created the Arno Schmidt Foundation to preserve, disseminate, and study the work of writer Arno Schmidt and has been on its board of directors since then. In 1984 he also launched the Hamburg Foundation for the Advancement of Research and Culture. In the same year, he established the Hamburg Institute for Social Research [Hamburger Institut für Sozialforschung]. Among the honors awarded to Reemtsma
are the Wieland Medal (1984); the Copernicus Medal of the University of Kraków (1987); the Lessing Prize of the City of Hamburg (1997); the Fine Arts Prize for Literature of Lower Saxony (2001); the Leibniz Medal of the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences (2002); the Heinz Galinski Prize for fostering German-Jewish understanding (2003) and an honorary doctorate of the University of Magdeburg (2007). Recent publications include: *Wie hätte ich mich verhalten? und andere nicht nur deutsche Fragen* (2001); *Das unaufhebbare Nichtbescheidwissen der Mehrheit* (2005); *Folter im Rechtstaat?* (2005); *Das Scheinproblem "Willensfreiheit". Ein Plädeyer für das Ende einer überflüssigen Debatte* (2008) and *Vertrauen und Gewalt. Versuch über eine besondere Konstellation der Moderne* (2008, engl. *Trust and Violence: An Essay on a Modern Relationship*, 2012).

**CHOON-LEONG SEOW**

*Job’s Wife, With Due Respect*

Job’s wife has been viewed in overwhelmingly negative light in the history of reception. She has been portrayed as a shrew, a blasphemer, a second Eve, and an agent of Satan. Yet there is also a persistent tradition that depicts her positively as a devoted wife and a manifestation of divine grace. This paper reviews this “minority report” in Jewish, Christian, and Muslim interpretations, notably in literature and the visual arts.

**David Shulman**

**A South Indian Job? Valin, King of the Monkeys, and an Impassive God**
In classical India we find the Job-like figure of Valin, King of the Monkeys, killed without reason and from an ambush by Rama, who is God. Valin's heartbroken, uncomprehending protest became a major theme in the medieval literature of South India. I will present one version from the Tamil Ramayana of Kampan and a short DVD segment showing Valin's death in the classical Kudiyattam theater of Kerala.

**David Shulman** is Professor of Indian Studies and Comparative Religion at the Hebrew University, Jerusalem, where he has been teaching since 1977, after obtaining a Ph.D. in Tamil Literature from the University of London. He has held visiting appointments at the University of Wisconsin, Johns Hopkins, the University of Pennsylvania, and the University of Chicago. He is an elected member of the Israel Academy of Sciences and Humanities, and from 1992 to 1998 directed the Institute for Advanced Studies in Jerusalem. He is now director of the Martin Buber Society of Fellows in the Humanities. He has been a Guggenheim and MacArthur Fellow, among many other distinctions, and was awarded the Emet Prize. He has published over thirty books as author or editor, including works on numerous aspects of Indian culture and comparative studies in culture and religion. David Shulman is also a peace activist and a member of a joint Israeli-Palestinian grassroots movement for non-violence called *Ta’ayush*. His book on the Israeli peace movement, *Dark Hope*, has been published in several languages.

---

**Emilie Townes**

**Primordial Memories**
Human suffering is universal and particular. Most suffer, but no one else can own our individual sorrow. This is the paradox we live in and must seek to find ways of forming more just and healthy relationships and communities. Within this paradox, I will explore the particularity of Black suffering in the United States as it relates to the expendability of African American children in a culture of violence.

**Emilie Townes** is the Andrew W. Mellon Professor of African American Religion and Theology at Yale University Divinity School. Prior to her appointment at Yale, Professor Townes was the Carolyn Beaird Professor of
Christian Ethics at Union Theological Seminary in New York. She served as
president of the American Academy of Religion in 2008. Professor Townes
is an ordained American Baptist clergywoman. Her teaching and general
research interests focus on Christian ethics, womanist ethics, critical social
theory, cultural theory and studies, as well as on postmodernism and so-
cial postmodernism. Her specific interests include health and health care;
the cultural production of evil; analyzing the linkages among race, gender,
class, and other forms of oppression; and developing a network between
African American and Afro-Brazilian religious and secular leaders and
community-based organizations. Among her publications are Womanist
Justice, Womanist Hope (1993); In a Blaze of Glory: Womanist Spirituality
as Social Witness (1995); Breaking the Fine Rain of Death: African Ameri-
can Health and a Womanist Ethic of Care (1998); and Womanist Ethics
and the Cultural Production of Evil (2006).

JAMES WOOD

Job and the Novel

The English Romantic poet Samuel Taylor Coleridge once said that the
Book of Job was proof that the Bible was written by man and not by
God—“for no God would have invented such a self-incriminating story.”
The significant word here might be “story.” The Job story stands not only
at the center of theodicy, but at the center of nineteenth-century biblical
criticism, and that movement’s discovery that the bible is made up of con-
structed narratives. The Book of Job is indeed closer to story, to fable, to
tale, than perhaps any other book in the Bible. I shall look at Job as a nar-
rative, and will also look at the use made of Job by other narratives—
principally by that modern secular form, the novel. Is there some neces-
sary connection between the rebellious blasphemy of the Job story and
narrative itself? Is there some deep connection between theodicy (and
anti-theodicy) and narrative? I think there is, and will try to suggest why.

James Wood has been a staff writer and book critic at The New Yorker
since 2007 and is Professor of the Practice of Literary Criticism at Harvard
University. He was the chief literary critic at the Guardian, in London,
from 1992 to 1995, and a senior editor at The New Republic from 1995 to
2007. His critical essays have been collected in two volumes, The Broken
Estate: Essays on Literature and Belief (1999) and The Irresponsible Self:
On Laughter and the Novel (2004), which was a finalist for the National

---

**Exhibition**

**GÜNTER UECkre**

*The Book of Job*

Introduction:  
**FRIEDHELM MENNEKES** SJ, COLOGNE


**Günther Uecker** was born in Mecklenburg in 1930 and began his art education in 1949 in Wismar. He later attended art school in Berlin’s Weissensee and in Düsseldorf, where he studied under Otto Pankok at the Kunstakademie. Between 1955 and 1957 he created structured relief paintings; starting in 1959 his central motif consisted of so-called nail rhythms. As a member of the Zero Group he constructed *Kinetic Light Mills*, while in 1966 he began typographic experiments, printwork and relief paintings. In the 1980s he worked with ashes, grass, and branches, and created the series *The Endangering of Man by Man*, a theater set for Bremen and Stuttgart. He later converted his reflective watercolor landscapes and relief painting into prints.

Günther Uecker exhibited at Documenta 3, 4, and 6, and at the German pavilion of the Venice Biennale in 1970. Uecker’s work is included in nu-
merous public institutions such as the Albright-Knox Art Gallery, Buffalo; Tate Modern, London; The Museum of Modern Art, New York; Centre Georges Pompidou, Paris; and the Peggy Guggenheim Collection, Venice.

For over thirty years the Jesuit Friedhelm Mennekes has been involved with exhibitions at the crossroads between art and religion. From a historical standpoint, the combination is natural, but Mennekes also introduces contemporary artwork into churches both old and new, a move that has generated much controversy. This reason: unlike past eras, the modern age puts religion and art in separate autonomous spheres. The art world develops new forms; the Church stresses dogmatic clarity. Beyond these tensions between the realms of art and faith, however, lie many opportunities to think about the values they share.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Thursday, June 7</th>
<th>Friday, June 8</th>
<th>Saturday, June 9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.30</td>
<td>Glenn Most, Pisa, Pisa</td>
<td>10.30 David Shulman, Jerusalem</td>
<td>10.30 Jan Philipp Reemtsma, Hamburg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>The Jobless Greeks</em></td>
<td><em>A South Indian Job? Valin, King of the Monkeys, and an Impassive God</em></td>
<td><em>Can We Forgive a God?</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>Gerhard Begrich, Berlin, Berlin</td>
<td>12.00 Gerhard Begrich, Berlin</td>
<td>12.00 Amber Carpenter, Buffalo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|            | *Hiob am Meer*                                                                   | *Job in Egypt? When Justice Fails*                                              | *And none of us deserving the cruelty or the grace*: *In Search of the Buddhist Job*
| 13.00      | Lunchbreak                                                                       | 13.00 Lunchbreak                                                                | 13.00 Lunchbreak                                                                  |
|            | Konstanty Gebert, Warsaw                                                        | *Job's Wife, with Due Respect*                                                  | *Primordial Memories*                                                            |
|            | *Lost in Translation*                                                            |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |
| 19.00      | Susan Neiman, Potsdam                                                            | 17.00 Eva Illouz, Jerusalem                                                     | 17.00 Stephen Holmes, New York                                                   |
|            | *Reason in the World: A Reading of Job*                                          | *Why Job Troubles us*                                                           | *The Evil of Theodicy and the Disenchantment of the World*                        |
| 20.30      | Exhibition Opening Günther Uecker                                               | 17.00 James Wood, Cambridge, Mass.                                              | 17.00 Jan Philipp Reemtsma, Hamburg                                              |
|            | *Das Buch Hiob*                                                                  | *Job and the Novel*                                                             | *Can We Forgive a God?*                                                          |
|            | Introduction: Friedhelm Mennekes                                                 |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |